

AEGON INSIGHTS

Additionality: The Secret Sauce or the Snake Oil of Impact Investing?

Much has been written and discussed recently on impact investment, and an increasing number of investors have become interested in the idea of 'putting their money to good use'. The Global Impact Investor Network (GIIN) estimated the global impact investing market to stand at USD 1.164 trillion in 2022¹. When discussing impact investments and what defines them, a certain common mantra tends to be repeated: intentionality, additionality and measurability.

What is impact investing?

Every economic activity will generate positive and negative social and environmental impacts. A textile manufacturer will likely be providing several workers with their livelihoods (hopefully through living wages), be paying local and national taxes thereby contributing to public goods and perhaps also investing in local communities. At the same time, they will be consuming a lot of freshwater, potentially polluting the environment through the use of dyes and other chemicals and generating other negative environmental impacts that can vary depending on how they source their raw materials, the recyclability of their products and so on.

Impact investing is anchored on the concept of intentionally trying to maximize the net positive social or environmental impacts of investment decisions. In its most widely accepted definition, from the GIIN, 'Impact investments are investments made with the intention to generate positive, measurable social and environmental impact alongside a financial return'.

How do we evidence an intention?

The consensus is that, at a minimum, an investor should be transparent about their impact objective prior to making the investment. To be credible, such a documented intention should include the assumptions being made about how the investment will lead to the intended impact. This is usually called a 'theory of change'.



Brunno Maradei
Global Head of
Responsible
Investment

“*Impact investing is anchored on the concept of intentionally trying to maximize the net positive social or environmental impacts of investment decisions.*”

¹ <https://thegiin.org/research/publication/impact-investing-market-size-2022/>

What is additionality?

Assumptions are made at each step of this process, the first of which is that an investment enables the economic activity in question. The term 'additionality' is usually referenced with regards to this assumption, or in other words, it questions whether the activity would have taken place without the investment proposed.

As a test based on a counterfactual scenario, additionality can never be proved beyond reasonable doubt: there may always be an investor somewhere willing to have made the investment if you had not. Intuitively many impact investors use liquidity as a proxy for additionality under the assumption that the more liquid an investment, the larger the number of investors willing to make that investment and therefore the lower the additionality of their investment. But this assumption may not hold true in every scenario and may be difficult to test. For example, there may be more investors willing to invest in venture capital funds in the US than those willing to purchase green bonds issued by a small emerging market financial institution, even if at first glance most would categorize venture capital funds as some of the most illiquid and therefore 'additional' investments.

Furthermore, it is difficult to test whether all investors would be willing to invest on the same terms, further hampering the additionality test. This is an additionality measurement problem often encountered in development finance. While at face value you may find many investors that would respond positively to a potential investment opportunity, their perception of risk and demanded return to compensate for that risk can vary significantly, especially in developing countries and more illiquid asset classes where market pricing signals are harder to obtain, and risks are harder to assess.

Potential additionality assumed to decrease with increasing liquidity



“Intuitively many impact investors use liquidity as a proxy for additionality under the assumption that the more liquid an investment, the larger the number of investors willing to make that investment and therefore the lower the additionality of their investment.”

Using liquidity as a proxy for additionality without careful consideration of the impact objective and the means proposed to achieve such impact may also inadvertently penalize investments with high potential impact. Consider the common impact objective of mitigating climate change. At one end of the spectrum, liquidity as a proxy for additionality would lead us to conclude that a venture capital investment in new carbon reduction technologies has the highest additionality. At the other end of the spectrum, an investor claiming impact by investing in large cap stocks such as Tesla would be classified as having low additionality, given capital is just changing hands in secondary markets without being directed towards new projects. However, an activist investor taking targeted positions in the oil majors with the objective of transforming those companies and getting them to set Scope 3² emission targets might have a much larger real-world impact on climate change mitigation than the venture capitalist and her investment in unproven, potentially unscalable technologies.



² Scope 3 emissions are indirect greenhouse gas emissions that are not captured by Scope 1 and 2 reporting. They occur in the value chain of the reporting company, including both upstream and downstream activities, and in the case of oil majors, capture the majority of the company's emissions, i.e., those resulting from use of their products.

Do we really need to prove additionality to be credible impact investors?

These challenges do not necessarily mean additionality is a useless concept. Many impact investors are keen to demonstrate or be assured that their capital is transformative, and additionality presents the ultimate test as to whether the world changed as a result of the investment made. However, when addressing additionality, claims are hard to verify, and investment liquidity remains an imperfect proxy. It is reassuring that the impact investment definitions proposed by regulatory and legislative bodies so far do not refer to additionality directly, as enforcement would be problematic otherwise. Instead of focusing too much attention on arguing and proving additionality, impact investors are better served by thorough descriptions of the theory of change, including the assumptions made at each stage and the risks to those assumptions playing out, as well as increased efforts to measure outcomes and evaluate long-term impacts.

Disclosures

For Professional Investors only and not to be distributed to or relied upon by retail clients.

This document is for informational purposes only in connection with the marketing and advertising of products and services, and is not investment research, advice or a recommendation. It shall not constitute an offer to sell or the solicitation to buy any investment nor shall any offer of products or services be made to any person in any jurisdiction where unlawful or unauthorized. Any opinions, estimates, or forecasts expressed are the current views of the author(s) at the time of publication and are subject to change without notice. The research taken into account in this document may or may not have been used for or be consistent with all Aegon Asset Management investment strategies. References to securities, asset classes and financial markets are included for illustrative purposes only and should not be relied upon to assist or inform the making of any investment decisions. It has not been prepared in accordance with any legal requirements designed to promote the independence of investment research, and may have been acted upon by Aegon AM and Aegon AM staff for their own purposes.

All investments contain risk and may lose value. Responsible investing is qualitative and subjective by nature, and there is no guarantee that the criteria utilized, or judgement exercised, by any company of Aegon Asset Management will reflect the beliefs or values of any one particular investor. Responsible investing norms differ by region. There is no assurance that the responsible investing strategy and techniques employed will be successful. Investors should consult their investment professional prior to making an investment decision.

Opinions and/or example trades/securities represent our understanding of markets both current and historical and are used to promote Aegon Asset Management's investment management capabilities: they are not investment recommendations, research or advice. Sources used are deemed reliable by Aegon Asset Management at the time of writing. Please note that this marketing is not prepared in accordance with legal requirements designed to promote the independence of investment research, and is not subject to any prohibition on dealing by Aegon Asset Management or its employees ahead of its publication.

All data is sourced to Aegon Asset Management (a trade name of Aegon Investment Management B.V.) unless otherwise stated. The document is accurate at the time of writing but is subject to change without notice. Data attributed to a third party ("3rd Party Data") is proprietary to that third party and/or other suppliers (the "Data Owner") and is used by Aegon Investment Management B.V. under license. 3rd Party Data: (i) may not be copied or distributed; and (ii) is not warranted to be accurate, complete or timely. None of the Data Owner, Aegon Investment Management B.V. or any other person connected to, or from whom Aegon Investment Management B.V. sources, 3rd Party Data is liable for any losses or liabilities arising from use of 3rd Party Data.

Aegon Investment Management B.V. (Chamber of Commerce number: 27075825) is registered with the Netherlands Authority for the Financial Markets as a licensed fund management company. On the basis of its fund management license Aegon Investment Management B.V. is also authorized to provide individual portfolio management and advisory services. Aegon AM NL also operates through branches in Germany and Spain. These branches are regulated by the BaFin (Germany) and CNMV (Spain) based on the home-host state supervision rules.

AdTrax: 6300380.1. Exp Date: 31 January 2025